

**Final Evaluation Report**

***"Recognition, Establishment  
and Protection of  
Human Right for the Dalits  
Community People" Project***

Implementing Organization:  
**PARITTRAN**

Supported by  
**Manusher Jonno Foundation (MJF)**

Evaluated by  
**Md. Mustafizur Rahman**

October 2008

## Table of Contents

Executive Summary _____	3
Chapter one: Overview of the Project _____	4
Introduction: _____	4
The Project Brief: _____	4
Project Goal, purpose, objectives and outcome _____	5
Chapter Two: Performances Assessment _____	6
Review of project implementation strategy _____	6
How far the targets were achieved _____	7
The qualitative aspect of the performance of Activities _____	8
Major Achievement of the Project: _____	11
Constrain faced by the project _____	12
Performances: looking by major Criteria _____	14
Chapter Three: Recommendation and conclusion _____	19
Recommendation _____	19
Conclusion _____	20
Annex: 1     Methodology and Scope of work _____	21
Procedure and steps _____	21
Methodology _____	21
Sampling _____	22
Scope of work _____	22

## Executive Summary

Being outcaste and socially, economically and politically oppressed, *Horijon* of Monirampur are living a life deprivation and dishonor and they have been victim of cruel caste system. They are born to suffer. They work hard from dawn to dusk to eke out a living but hardly manage.

Against this backdrop, PARITTRAN, which has been working for these untouchables from inception, took up the incumbent project for the interests of marginalized and vulnerable Dalit with the support of Manusher Jonno Foundation (MJF). The present evaluation is the Final Evaluation of the said project.

The consultant along with his team observed various activities of the project first-hand in the field. Moreover, they interviewed the concerned personnel, stakeholders and reviewed available documents. Thus both qualitative and quantitative techniques were in operation to judge the project properly.

The intervention was very urgent since these Dalit are suffering manifold problems in the daily life. They are frustrated, exploited and even they are not considered as full human being.

The major findings show that the project able to bring few changes in social life. Now they have better access to shop, market, public restaurant, or place of public entertainment. The untouchables are able to use of any utensils and other articles kept in public restaurant. Immediate response from the different service provider is encouraging and CSDI gives special priority to distribute different safety net program.

Specially scholarship and stipend for Dalit student reduce the dropout rate and encourage the entire community towards education. They got necessary information, message that was urgently required. Theater shows increase consciousness and awareness. Community people know their right and privilege. They raise voice if found any Humiliation or Discrimination against them. Debate dialogue sensitized the mainstream people. Particularly Students become sympathetic and get the sense of equality among the classmate.

The main challenge is ignorance and poverty that pushes the untouchable to inhuman life. The Dalit are not ready to reject the Hindu rituals and beliefs and they lack self-dignity and self-motivation. It is mysterious that why people are practicing the religion that cannot protect their human right or spread hatred among the believer?

The project tried to bring some significant changes and only two year is not enough for change the situation. PARITTRAN has design the project to change the existing situation for the hope of better status quo. Many social evils like early marriage, dirtiness, dowry, eve teasing, alcoholism, illiteracy, and poor sanitation were high prevalence in Dalit community but situation is improving.

The project is no doubt a commendable move to protect the rights of the Dalit people of different profession. The consultant has identified some important drawbacks of the project and recommended solutions accordingly. If properly followed, it is expected that it will be able to contribute to the fulfillment of the project goals well.

Mustafizur Rahman  
Consultant

# Chapter one: Overview of the Project

## **Introduction:**

Caste based discrimination is widespread in south-western region of Bangladesh. These Dalit people are really kept untouchable in various ways through denial of education, health, socio-economic and political rights. They usually live in substandard conditions oppressed and suppressed by society. They have been living this way for centuries but never consider themselves as part of the society or even don't have courage to speak for themselves or get their right and privileges fulfilled. They are ruled and governed by the society, by the political and social leader in such a manner that they only get exploited and are used as instrument for achieving other vested interest. As a matter of fact they are not consider full human beings.

Against this backdrop PARITTRAN took up the "Recognition, Establishment And Protection of The Human Right for The Dalits Community People" project to ensure human right of the Dalit community through creating a positive attitude and support by greater society. This is the Final evaluation report of the same project.

Projects are the basic instrument of development intervention, and evaluation is crucial to understanding result of these interventions. Typically, projects are designed to change the existing situation for the hope of better and it is aimed at providing feedback to help improve the effectiveness of programs and policies. Performance evaluations are decision-making tools for policymakers that promote accountability to the public.

Program evaluation is an assessment through carefully collecting information about a program or some aspect of a program in order to make necessary decisions about the program. The term is used in a variety or different ways concerning a range of different subjects and interchangeably with other terms like measurements or estimate. The evaluation procedure has several aims: it is an instrument providing inputs to the management and staff of on going interventions for the purposes of improving implementation; it provides information and experience to be used and design and planning of future activities; it is used internally in policy and strategy formulation by aid agencies; and provides information on the effectiveness and efficiency.

**Manusher Jonno Foundation (MJF)** has decided to evaluate performances of its partner project, funded and supervised per se. Basically it's a progress evaluation; try to answers the basic questions like: Was the project successful? What were its strengths and weaknesses? To what extent did the project or program meet the overall goal(s)? Are the participants moving toward the anticipated goals of the project? Which of the activities and strategies are aiding the participants to move toward the goals? Is this project replicable and transportable etc?

## **The Project Brief:**

In the Indian subcontinent since the time immemorial a particular group of people has used religion as a weapon to utilize various social facilities for themselves. By using religion they set up a social classification of people, which has become well known under the name of "caste system". The social classification was and continues to be deadly for a lot of people living in this subcontinent.

So many people living in the southwestern region of Bangladesh have been victim of this cruel system. These people are known with different names like Harijans, Untouchables, Dalit People, Tapshili Group, Dalit Minorities, Schedule Cast, Bhu-Putra, Bhumij etc.

Discrimination and oppression are still going on against them and they have great difficulties in having access to local resources. They are still marginalized from the larger society and are extremely poor, illiterate, landless, asset less, right less, underdeveloped and frustrated. As already mention above women of these dalit communities are even more exploited than their male counterpart. Young women particularly are increasingly becoming victim of sexual harassment, eve teasing, and unkind behavior in general. Their life is still full of agony and distress. The national policy makers have constantly overlooked their situation and even NGOs have not come up with a plan for these groups of people.

Under the above circumstances, with the past experiences in working in the southwestern costal areas with dalit communities, PARITTRAN puts emphasis on awareness raising activities for the reduction of human right violation. PARITTRAN consider that community mobilization is essential to get the untouchable dalit recognized as fellow human beings. At the same time PARITTRAN believes that the socio- economic leader should be influenced to come up in offering theses downtrodden community people with rights and privileges. The law enforcing agencies too should try to protect human right violation against them.

Realizing this truth PARITTRAN as a voluntary organization that has been working with the community people for their betterment.

## **Project Goal, purpose, objectives and outcome**

**Project Title:** Recognition, Establishment And Protection of The Human Right for The Dalits Community People.

**Project goals:** Ensure human right of the Dalit community through creating a positive attitude and support by greater society towards the Dalit community.

### **Objectives:**

- Ensure access of dalits to their social rights and privileges.
- Make the dalit community aware on their rights to become vocal in demanding their rights.
- Create a social movement in protesting and preventing human rights violation against dalits.

### **TARGET BENEFICIARIES/STAKEHOLDERS:**

- i) Dalit community people of the project area.
- ii) NGOs/CBOS, socio- cultural organization, local administration, law enforcing agencies, journalist, LEBs, and local leader, students, parents and school managing committee.
- iii) Adolescent boys and girls of the dalit community including students.

**GEOGRAPHIC LOCATION:** Haridaskati, Bhojgati, Shyamkur, Durbadanga and Kashimnagar Union of Monirampur Upzilla under Jessore District.

**DURATION OF THE PROJECT:** 02 years.

## Chapter Two: Performances Assessment

### Review of project implementation strategy

This is a right-based project developed to recognize, establish and protect the human right for the Dalit people of Monirampur of Jessore district where Dalit are heavily affected by various form of discriminatory practices both in the private and public sphere. They are denied of access to common property, entrance to hair dressing shops, hotels and restaurants, educational institution etc on grounds of **ethnic** and **caste discrimination**.

The implementing strategy of project illustrates below to comprehend how did it work and how it was approached.

- ▶ This is the debut for PARITTRAN in implementing project and currently no other project is operating. All the staffs have been recruited from the same community and they took the project as a duty to achieve their mission. The members of the organization have been working to emancipate Dalit people generally and for managing activities of the incumbent project particularly, it is consist of 8 personnel i.e. Director (1), Project coordinator (1), Accounts & Admin Officer (1), Trainer (1), Advocacy organizer (3), and Support staff (1).

The project is structurally simple and flexible which makes them relatively easy to implement.

- ▶ Parent organization gives full authority to the project. It enjoyed almost full autonomy. PC had full line authority over the project. All member of the project workforce directly responsible to the Director. The project team motivation was high.
- ▶ It gave focus on civil society, Local Administration, local elite, and CEA as strategic partner for achieving goal. Although they are member of SWIFT, ECD, SAHR, INSA, OND, but collective activity yet to take place. The community people become more and more sensitized about the their rights. **Caste discrimination** serves the purpose of the **Brahmans**. Strategically it is difficult to address them. State intervention is required to change the position.
- ▶ It is really important to involve the local influential people in implementing the project activities. Therefore, in every union under the working area, a CEA was formed comprising of the local elite, member of Local elected bodies, journalists, lawyers, teachers, guardians, doctors and other influential personalities of the locality. If the CEA could function it would able to make Project sustainable. Although CEA is working voluntarily but long lasting commitment is required.
- ▶ To implement the project, it has strengthened the linkage with different service providers, which is strategically important. Local government, law enforcing agencies, local schools, Hospital etc. lend a hand of necessary supports.
- ▶ If we examine the project design we found one important issue is missing that is that sensitization to the **Brahmans** on their false pride. Dialogue meeting should arrange among the so-called **Brahmans** who never interested to protect the honor of Dalit or recognize them as a human being.
- ▶ The vital question arises whether there is emancipation from the caste-based discriminations. Most of the people opined that economic well-being could establish the basic human rights for them. Education is another weapon to mainstreaming. It is

unfortunate that the Dalits are not ready to reject the Hindu rituals and beliefs. Apparently economic well-being and education is considered the better solution.

## Activity Review / Review results achieved against original plan

Action or series of action (activities) are the building block of any project and activities are designed in such a way that if it were performed, one day the project would reach the goal. Sometimes it is found that activities are done but goal could not be achieved.

The evaluation team has gone through the project activities of this project to comprehend whether the project activities are smart enough to catch the objectives? Have a look to the project activities in the following box and it shows the major task only. The detail activity will be provided latter.

- \* Development of advocacy group (CEA) and orientation
- \* Dialogue meeting with CEA and CSDI and sharing meeting
- \* Organize issue based debate and discussion
- \* Provide scholarship and stipend for Dalit student
- \* Establish linkage with service providing authority
- \* Rally and day observation, human chain
- \* Mass awareness campaign through interactive drama
- \* Cross learning visit
- \* Publication

Considering the project goal, and objectives it seems activities are minimum in types and number. Dialogue meeting with CEA and CSDI, organization issue based debate, Establishment linkage with service providing authorities are vital activities and rest of are common in MJF funded project.

To creating a positive attitude towards the Dalit, enough sensitization works are not set for the greater society. Debate and dialogue to smash the Hindu tradition and mythology is crucial as these are become obsolete and harmful for the progress of humanity and peace.

Mass awareness campaign through interactive drama is found the smart activities and most effective also. Dialogue and sharing meeting are aligned with the approach, goal and try to cover many aspects of recognition and establishment Dalit's right.

## How far the targets were achieved

Generally projects are appraised to know to what extent it achieved the given target, which were set during the design stage. Comparison between target and achievement gives the status of realization. If anyone goes through the target –achievements matrix of project depicted below one will find straightforwardly that 90 percent target were achieved during the timeframe of the project.

There is a limitation for any target achieve frame work that it give quantitative value only, for the qualitative aspects of the achievements need intensive investigation and during the field visit evaluation team try to assess this aspect. The qualitative aspect has been illustrated later in this chapter. Have a look to the following Matrix only for quantitative assessment.

	ACTIVITIES	TARGET	ACHIEVEMENT
1	Project orientation for the staff	1	1
2	Baseline survey	1	1
3	Development of advocacy group (CEA)	6	6
4	Sharing meeting	7	7
5	Training of CEA groups	8	8
6	Organize issue based debate and discussion meeting at school and college	12	12
7	Discussion meeting with community people	24	24
8	Scholarship and stipend for student of Dalit	6*60	6*60
9	Dialogue meeting with CEA and CSDI	12	12
10	Sharing meeting		
11	Mass awareness campaign through interactive drama	120	120
12	Seminar advocacy workshop at regional level	1	1
14	Rally and Human chain	14	12
15	Cross Learning Visit (abroad)	1	1
16	Day observation and mobilization	3	3
17	Publication (poster, Billboard, booklet etc)	2000	2000
18	Training for the staff capacity development	9	9

- ▶ Most of the work completed as per plan. Some of the event takes place more than initial target, sometimes achievement was need based and few activity found late started.

## The qualitative aspect of the performance of Activities

### ***Formation advocacy group (CEA) and operation***

The advocacy Group formed by the people of dalit community and local civil society has taken place from the inception of the project. CEA found very vital to implement this project. It initiated the social movement in favor of untouchable communities. Member selection of CRPC is praiseworthy. All the committee has formed by local influential, benevolent, diversified people.

The evaluation team has talked to them and found following observations.

- Union and Thana level advocacy groups are working actively in favor of Dalit community in establishing their right with the cooperation of mainstreaming people. Local leader, law enforcing agencies, journalist, LEBs and service provider are sensitized and supportive to promote the interest of Dalit
- CEA met together regularly as per plan and their presence is satisfactory. During the meetings, the CEA discuss many issues with CSDI. These include what are their basic rights and privileges, what they can do to materialize their demand etc. Community people become conscious about the rights as human being.
- Although training makes the CEA knowledgeable and resourceful, they cannot capitalize these learning and have little option to use it.

### ***Dialogue meeting with CEA and CSDI and sharing meeting***



- The project sensitized the CSDI through sharing meeting but more events are needed. The aim of this meeting is to increase the access the facility that each institution is providing.
- Advocacy session facilitated to build linkage with other GO, NGO service providers for ensuring required supports. Some social leaders are influenced to protect the right and status of Dalits. They are committed to remove deprivation.
- Sensitization meeting with Journalists should increase since journalist could explore the situation to promote discrimination-free environment.

### *Organize issue based debate and discussion*

- Debates widened the knowledge on social issue and sensitized young generation. They are aware of their right, democracy and governance. This next generation would be more vigilant on HR protection for untouchable community.
- Debate is one of the successful activities of this project. Students become sympathetic to their classmate and they sit together now.

### *Rally and day observation*

The **PRITTRAN** organized rallies, processions and gatherings to promote Dalit issues toward concerned authority. Rally has been organized both Upzilla and Union level and media published the news giving importance. It also discussed the main theme of the days. Some of the observations are mentioned below

- Important days like International day for the elimination of racial discrimination have observed. The event was well organized and successful. Community people participated with placard, festoon, and banner.
- Advocacy tools like rally, gathering help to gain attention of all the strata of people to materialize the demand of the untouchables. For creating supportive opinion the rally try to acquaint so that the mainstream people may heed.

### *Publication of news & Distribution IEC material*

- Project has taken the media as an important tool to disseminate messages and negative impacts of violation of Human rights. Local and national newspaper published Dalit news regularly from project inception to sensitize and aware project activities.
- Publication of poster, leaflet, and sticker created people's awareness and got support from public. The message was well articulated and rightly addressed. These materials have distributed and placed in strategic locations, public places for common audience of the working areas.

### *Mass awareness campaign through interactive drama*

A cultural team has been formed with Dalit youth. Team member have trained on Dalit issues and team is competent in script writing, conducting rehearsal, direction, and staging shows.

- ▶ This cultural team participated and organized road show, drama, cultural program etc. The performances of Team were remarkable.
- ▶ Theater show was well-organized and successful event. The adolescent boys and girls told their discrimination, stigma, sorrow, and deprivation to the audience.
- ▶ Message delivery from the Cultural team is outstanding and audience friendly considering level of awareness. People reaction and response was remarkable. Shows were really interactive and participatory.

### ***Miscellaneous***

- All the information found well documented and preserved as well.
- The cross learning visit widened the social and behavioral attitude of community leader.

## Major Achievement of the Project:

### ○ Promotion of social dignity and honorable life

- (1) Increase access to any shop, public restaurant, hotel or place of public entertainment.
- (2) Dalits are able to use of any utensils and other articles kept in public restaurant, hotel for the use of the general public or of any section thereof;
- (3) The practice of their traditional family profession or the carrying on of any occupation, trade or business or employment in any job is respected.
- (4) The use or access to any school, Bazar/ market, School, any bathing ghat, burial or cremation ground, any sanitary convenience, any road or passage or any other place of public resort are allowed.
- (5) Have access to hair cutting saloon.
- (6) Non-Dalits seldom use filthy word against them.
- (7) **Dalits raise voice if found any Humiliation or Discrimination against them.**

### ○ Access to health services

- ▶ 8.6% Dalit people got health facilities (as per UP)
- ▶ Now health personnel make visit to Dalit community.
- ▶ Previously they are not habituated to go to hospital, clinic or other health services and now they frequently go to the services and maintain communication with the concern staff.

### ○ Promotion of education

- ▶ Stipend or educational support (60 students got support) has reduced 40% dropout.
- ▶ Parents are encouraged to send their children to school and realize the importance of literacy.
- ▶ Many benefited students got scholarship and passed SSC examination successfully.
- ▶ 80 elderly people become literate by government intervention.
- ▶ Cumulative enrolment in secondary education and 15% more enrolment of Dalit children found in primary education.
- ▶ Teachers also welcome the tendency of school going.

### ○ Better social well-being

- ▶ Early marriage are discouraged and prevalence is reducing.
- ▶ Girls and adolescent are face lesser eve-teasing
- ▶ Women are enjoying better right and experience lesser violence.
- ▶ Use of sanitation toilet and safe drinking water increased.
- ▶ Community people are more aware on cleanliness.
- ▶ Student respect each other and lesser use of abuse word.
- ▶ Tolerance among teacher, students increased through the sanitization and school debate competition.

### ○ Access to safety net program

- ▶ Widowhood Allowance (45)
  - ▶ Distribution of VGD: (Female: 223 and Male = 45)
  - ▶ Old Age Allowances (female: 40, male 36)
  - ▶ Tube-well for Safe Drinking Water (7)
  - ▶ Inclusion of name in the voter list:
  - ▶ Construction of a road to burial or cremation ground (.5 km)
  - ▶ Vaccination of Pregnant Mother and Children.
  - ▶ Birth registration.
- **PRITTRAN make a platform for Dalits**
  - **Local administrations are sensitized to eliminate religious/ caste based discrimination.**

### *Constrain faced by the project*

- The Hindu tradition does not believe in the concept of equality. The practice and prevalence of inequality has both the divine sanction and the sanction of the Law Books or the Dharma Shastras. There is no equality before the law or equal protection of law is not there since society has been arranged through a rigid system of social hierarchy based on caste.  
Again, by its very nature, the caste system goes against respect for an individual's dignity (Article 01), right to recognition as a person (Article 06), right to freedom of opinion and expression (Article 19). Further it has a racial origin since a person's caste is determined from birth itself and on the basis of color.
- The Dalit are not ready to reject the Hindu rituals and beliefs and they lack self-dignity and self-motivation. So called higher caste people never interested to protect the honor of Dalit or recognition as a human being and state is reluctant to provide basic necessity of life for the Dalits.
- Most of the dalit live in below the poverty line and maintain their livelihood doing the traditional family profession or business, which bring lower wage/ income. On the other hand, they could not mechanize their profession and they are not proficient in commercial production. Market competition is increasing day by day and at the same time Muslims are taking over their jobs. It is interesting that the same profession doing by the other community in efficient manner face no dignity crisis rather they are welcomed.
- The most important weapon to fight against the false pride of higher caste is education and it is the easiest way to mainstreaming. But Dalit lacks in formal and informal education. They never emphasize on education and could not realize the importance educating their new generation. Religious obstructions, distances of school, dropout, cost of learning materials, discrimination from student, teacher make them more vulnerable. Some parents believe that sending school is wasting of time and money rather it is better to earn and learn family profession.
- Dalits are not homogenous group. Heterogeneity found among this small community and they are not united. Small community with a many fraction and internal conflict never leads solidity. Leadership need to be free from any kind of adverse

discrimination is missing among the Dalit community. Due to lack of strong leadership, religious and social reform is not taking place.

- Many social evils like early marriage, dirtiness, dowry, eve teasing, alcoholism, illiteracy, poor sanitation is high prevalence in Dalit community.
- Christian Missionaries are continuously trying to convert them and Dalits are easily fall prey of the intervention. But the conversion could not protect the dignity and human right. Similarly micro-credit lending NGOs are exploiting them by unbearable interest of credit. Poor people fall in their trap let alone financial emancipation.
- Another great question arise here that why people are practicing the religion that cannot protect their human right or spread hatred among the believer? If people withdraw their belief from respectively religion and become atheist or non-practitioner then other believer could not discriminate in the name of religion.
- Due to political emergency situation of the country, the local administration (TNO) advised not to conduct rally, human chain and submission of memorandums the thana level.
- Some religious fundamentalists are obstructing the performances of drama and cultural program. Although problem were solved through discussion in some places but project had to stop other places. It is not clear why they prevented.
- Schools are not always ready to get permission to organize debate or meeting.
- Field visits by head office staffs to project area is few in number than what is required. Activity monitoring, output and impact monitoring need to be documented.

## Performances: looking by major Criteria

Every evaluation involves one or several criteria by which the merit of the intervention is judged. The consultant has used the following five criteria to estimate the performance of the incumbent project.

### Effectiveness

Different sessions were conducted to comprehend effectiveness of some the most fundamental component of the project. Effectiveness measurement is important because it gives understanding of input utilization, which component will be helpful for next intervention and help to compare among the components.

The measurement results are given in the following figure. Basically we have constructed the component based on the project activities. All the activities are not considered for the evaluation here, only four activities, which are important according to project staff as well as other stakeholder.

The following table shows that Advocacy group Formation (CEA) & operation is the most effective event as Advocacy session facilitated to build linkage with other GO, NGO service providers for ensuring required supports. CSDI are sensitized and supportive to promote the interest of Dalit.

On the other hand stakeholders believe that interactive drama is the second most effective component. Community people got necessary information from this Mass awareness campaign; they know about their position, vulnerability, basic and human rights, possible way-out etc. these drama open the eye and they know how so-called civilized people violates their rights in different form.

Provide scholarship and stipend for Dalit student is third effective component that has reduced dropout. Parents are encouraged to send their children to school and realize the importance of literacy. This support creates space to mainstreaming the untouchables.

Issue based debate and discussion is one of the successful activities of this project. Students become sympathetic to their classmate and they seat together now. They respect each other. Some social leaders are influenced to protect the right and status of untouchables.

Activities	Effectiveness	Rank of benefit achieved
Advocacy group Formation (CEA) & operation	1	1
Mass awareness campaign through interactive drama	2	3
Organize issue based debate and discussion	4	4
Provide scholarship and stipend for Dalit student	3	2

*(The higher the rank the lower the effectiveness for example rank 1 goes to Advocacy group Formation (CEA) & operation means it is the most effective component, similarly rank 2 means second most effective component. This process also used for assessing the benefit received by the stakeholder. Ranking always arises an important question which is- what are differences or gap among the ranks? That is difficult to answer but there is a gap and gap between the two qualitative aspects is difficult to measure but rank gives here valuables comparisons among the components.)*

We try to comprehend what factors make them benefited and level of benefits they achieved. They result according to stakeholders given in the same table is self-explanatory.

Impact here means the lasting and significant changes- positive, negative, intended or not- in the people's live brought about by the project intervention. Every intervention has its consequences it may be positive or negative, visible or invisible or it may be slow or quick. The impact assessment gives common understanding about result and we can exchange experience and innovations.

Human rights violation has challenged by NGO and it is the injustice against humanity. Civilized people desire abolished all forms of discrimination between all classes of society. People of dalit are deprived of right and privileges and cannot raise their voice.

The project tried to bring some significant changes and only two year is not enough for change the situation. Some impacts are quite visible in some sectors, which we mentioned in the following table. Some changes are taking place in the attitude, knowledge.

Issues	Types of changes	Level of effect
Promotion of social dignity	Positive	Community
Access to services (health, education etc.)	Positive	Beneficiary
Increase access to shop, public restaurant, or place of public entertainment	Positive	Community
Access to safety net program	Positive	Beneficiary
Better social well-being	Positive	Community
Increase consciousness and awareness	Positive	Community
Leadership development	Positive	Beneficiary

The most tangible impact of this project can be considered is the access to education, health and other services. Particularly scholarship and stipend for Dalit student reduce the dropout rate and encourage the entire community towards education, the important weapon to fight against the false pride of higher caste and it is the easiest way to mainstreaming.

The project able to bring a little change in social dignity. Now they have better access to any shop, market, public restaurant, or place of public entertainment. The untouchables are able to use of any utensils and other articles kept in public restaurant, hotel for the use of the general public or of any section thereof.

Theater shows increase consciousness and awareness. Community people know their right and privilege, why they are deprived, what is the way-out. They raise voice if found any humiliation or discrimination against them.

Debate dialogue sensitized the mainstream people. Particularly students irrespective of sex, ethnicity, and classes are sympathetic and get the sense of equality among the classmate.

Immediate response from the different service provider is encouraging and CSDI gives special priority to distribute different safety net program.

Many social evils like early marriage, dirtiness, dowry, eve teasing, alcoholism, illiteracy, and poor sanitation were high prevalence in Dalit community but situation is improving.

The changes, which have occurred due to project intervention, are expected to be positive. So no negative changes have taken place.

A development intervention is considered relevant if it matches the needs and priorities of its target groups, as well as the policy of the state and donor organization. We believe that the intervention helps to satisfy the needs directly or indirectly.

- ▶ The intervention is consistent with the livelihood strategies of untouchables who have been living an undignified life. This Harijan of southwestern region of Bangladesh have been victim of religious discrimination.
- ▶ The intervention was very urgent since these people are suffering manifold problems in earning income or living an honorable life. They have no social recognition, fair treatment and justice. They could not enjoy the Right and protection, which is their entitlement.

These poor folks have given a lot to the society but received nothing in return. They have been humiliated and their basic demands have not been met year after year. Due to poverty, ignorance and indifference of state, they are the victims. So it is sine-qua-non to understand their problems well.

- ▶ The project is well in tune with the development policies. Many laws (including international law and conventions) that seek to protect disadvantaged and marginalized people. Again, by its very nature, the caste system goes against respect for an individual's dignity (Article 01), right to recognition as a person (Article 06), right to freedom of opinion and expression (Article 19).
- ▶ We think the intervention is to a considerable extent technically adequate solution to the problem of the Dalit community of different profession and it tried to eliminate the some of the causes of the problems. Ignorance is the single most cause for their vulnerability, the Dalit are not ready to reject the Hindu rituals and beliefs and they lack self-dignity and self-motivation.
- ▶ It is mysterious that why people are practicing the religion that cannot protect their human right or spread hatred among the believer?

Anyway, the project tries to address many of the problems but do not have enough initiatives to make the society free from injustice and discrimination.



## Sustainability

Sustainability is the likelihood that the benefit from the intervention will be maintained at an appropriate level for a reasonably long period of time after the withdrawal of project support.

- There are some areas found indicating the benefit will continue after cessation of the assistance. We believe that access to different service provider will sustain and CSDI will provide required supports.
- CEA is one of the successful outcomes of this project and they are highly motivated and sensitized. They have been taking all sorts of steps for preserving and protection measures for promoting rights of Dalit. It is expected that their activities will continue.
- The project create linkage with different service providing organization for the community people therefore it is expected they get the access in existing services in the coming days.
- Since the target people are poor, illiterate and ignorant so they may not emancipated until strong leadership comes from the community.
- Most of the dalit live in below the poverty line and poverty is another strong cause for their vulnerability. Their traditional family profession or business could not bring required wage/ income. They are not proficient in commercial production. It is interesting that the same profession doing by the other community in efficient manner face no dignity crisis rather they are welcomed. All the efforts may lose if there is no professional sustainability.

## Efficiency

Efficiency is measured by the results received at the cost of resources. If the output level is high and the cost is low, the project can be termed as efficient. On the contrary, if the output level is poor and the cost is high, then it can be termed as inefficient. Taken this into consideration, the incumbent project can be termed as to some extent efficient as some positive and encouraging result has been found so far in the project with a reasonable cost.

The table shows that Program expenses burn the highest amount of money (42.63%), near half of the budget.

Description	Expenditure up to August 2008.
Salary	32.7 %
Office rent, maintenance, communication	5.17
Furniture/fixture equipment Procurement	7.63
Program expenses (training meeting workshop, capacity building, material for beneficiaries)	42.63
TA &DA with vehicle	5.72
Other Administrative expenses	4.78
Survey, evaluation, audit	1.50
Total	100 %

The second allocation goes to salary, which is only 32.7% of total budget. Program expenses actually should go to target people. Program expenses need to be allocated highest amount of money.

It seems only one third of financial resource goes to target people. To achieve the expected outcome more allocation requires for program expense.

## Chapter Three: Recommendation and conclusion

### *Recommendation*

- a) People must be educated to question the authenticity of Hindu tradition and its mythology and utility of inhuman or dehumanizing laws and customs and throw away what has become obsolete and harmful for the progress of humanity and peace in the world. The best way to raise condition is to make them knowledgeable, develop their human resource. The modern world is knowledge-based society. Knowledge is power the more they gain skill and knowledge, more they become powerful.
- b) Western concept of the freedom of expression or the right to form organization or association to raise their issues and concerns are not at the top for outcaste or Dalits. It is found economic well-being is considered as a prime indicator of the basic human rights for them. Therefore more program addressing economic well-being need to design
- c) Protect their traditional IGA. Every dalit community has its own IGA, where they have comparative advantage. What is needed is the inclusion advanced technology and mechanized the profession instead of manual production. For example there is huge demand of shoes but 80% demand is fulfilled by supply from outside.
- d) Since the ideas of discrimination embedded during the early age so children should give more focus particularly training program for school child will be more effective. Students irrespective of sex, ethnicity, and classes socialize together in an institution and gives sense of equality among the classmate. Special school program is recommended particularly.
- e) **Legal framework**  
In **India** and **Nepal**, caste system has eliminated by enactment of law and Bangladesh can easily follow the same process and experiences. Besides these, in line with international human rights standards, it needs to ensure that their constitutional and legal frameworks embody principles of nondiscrimination and equality. On the basis of transparent and participatory processes, states may need to strengthen provisions.
- f) **Promotion of education among the Dalit community is urgent.** Since education can mainstream effective way and develop talent and potential significantly therefore it is essential to arrange primary and vocational training for Dalit. Make access to free, compulsory and quality education. Strong linkages with different formal educational institutes need to be built up in sustainable profession. Steps would have to be taken so that the children can continue their study as well as work at the same time. PARITTRAN can manage Sponsorship for dalit children. Community People demand private tutor for the Dalit student and MJF should allocate more budgets for education of children.
- g) **Ensure access the services provider and arrange dialogue with them.** Dialogue between community people and service provider is essential since they have few access to the services and sometime they are not aware of the opportunity. Evidence suggests that education, health, housing, and safety net programs are of particular importance and adequate policies need to be put in place to ensure equality of access.
- h) **Political participation**  
Ensure that Dalit people are able to participate fully and fairly in domestic political processes are needed. Participation is a fundamental right, and is an essential strategy

to ensure that excluded groups are able to have a say in policies that affect their lives. There should be adequate representation in public institutions, including parliaments, local governments, and anti-discrimination bodies.

- i) Take necessary intervention to reduce the social evil like early marriage, dirtiness, dowry, eve teasing, alcoholism, illiteracy, poor sanitation which is high prevalence in Dalit community.
- j) Sanitize the Mass Media to promote human right for dalit. Responsible media reporting can make a significant contribution.
- k) Arrange dialogues with bazaar committee, school; committee, local elite, religious leader, UP member to remove discrimination. Local institutions need to ensure that there are available mechanisms to sanction discriminatory behaviors and provide effective remedies for victims. Build awareness of discrimination amongst public servants, and put systems in place so that local institutions do not engage in discrimination. These are needed as matter of priority in periods of transition.
- l) Education and inter-religious dialogue are vital pillars strategy to prevent religious intolerances and discrimination but here no enough focus has given. As to the use of education to promote the protection of and respect for freedom of religion or belief in order to strengthen peace, understanding and tolerance among individuals, the essential components should be school curricula and textbooks on education for tolerance, in particular religious tolerance, and for non-discrimination on racial grounds.

## *Conclusion*

It should be our vision that people are as equal as the teeth of a comb, and that no person is superior to any other except righteous deed. Civilized people desire abolished all forms of sectarianism and discrimination between all classes of society. It also abolished the privileges granted to people on account of their nationality, ancestry or lineage.

God created us from a single pair of a male and a female and made us into nations and tribes, that we may know each other. Civilization should treat all people equally before the law and grants them equal civil rights without any discrimination between a beggar and a prince, or a nobleman and a man of modest birth.

People must be educated to question the authenticity and utility of inhuman or dehumanizing laws and customs and discard what has become obsolete and harmful for the progress of humanity and peace in the world.

The establishment of a legal framework that protects the right to non-discrimination is a precondition for combating formal and informal discrimination and ensuring that victims of discrimination are able to seek redress.

The PARITTRAN has been trying to play a significant role to promote human rights and eliminate social discrimination in southwest Bangladesh where these issues are given least or almost zero priorities

## **Annex: 1 Methodology and Scope of work**

Project evaluation is an assessment through carefully collecting information about a program or some aspects of a program in order to make necessary decisions about the program. The term is used in a variety of different ways concerning a range of different subjects and interchangeably with other terms like measurements or estimates. The evaluation procedure has several aims: it is an instrument providing inputs to the management and staff of on going interventions for the purposes of improving implementation; it provides information and experience to be used and design and planning of future activities; it is used internally in policy and strategy formulation by aid agencies; and provides information on the effectiveness and efficiency.

### **Procedure and steps**

Because project evaluation is still in the early stages of development, there is no overarching or standardized framework, and no agreed-upon general methodology, process or model that can be applied to all varieties of policies, programs, and projects. Moreover choosing appropriate tools and methods depend on purpose and focus of the project assessment, its context and the resources available.

Project evaluation refers to any combination of qualitative and quantitative methods used to assess the consequences of a policy, project or program for measuring its objectives and reflection of program output. There is great variation in the scope, selection of methods and level of detail in the practices of assessment. Nevertheless, most project evaluation activity involves some form of the following basic steps.

- Step one: Get a thorough understanding of the intervention/program
- Step two: Specify the assessment problem
- Step three: Determine focus of assessment
- Step four: Retrieve evidence
- Step five: Collect primary data (as appropriate)
- Step six: Interpret evidence
- Step seven: Synthesize/consolidate evidence
- Step eight: Formulate findings and recommendations
- Step nine: Disseminate findings and recommendations

*Of course, not all assessment programs conduct all of these steps, or conduct them in sequence.*

### **Methodology**

Methodology of project evaluation depends on types or nature of program intervention, category and forms of assessment (such as needs assessments, accreditation, cost/benefit analysis, effectiveness, efficiency, formative, summative, goal-based, process, outcomes, etc.) scope of work, budget and nature of data or variables.

For assessing the performances and carefully collecting information about a project or different aspect of a program in order to make necessary evaluation about the program relevant methods used. For any assessments there is no single tool and generally evaluation needs many methods but produce fewest result. Considering nature and form of this project, we use the following methods and techniques.

## **Methods used for review results achieved against original plan**

Single tools, methods, and approaches never can assess project evaluation and we use here the Rapid appraisal methods, Performance indicators/ analysis, Impact evaluation etc.

To know to what extent the project met the expected output, focus group discussion (FGD) were conducted, some session with the CEA, CSDI, and some session with the project implementing staffs.

Before going to field visit, desk review was conducted by arranging meeting with key members (program and project core staffs and responsible staffs) of PARITTRAN and based on discussion the evaluation team get a thorough understanding of the intervention and determine focus of assessment.

The evaluation team visited different sites and talked with untouchable both male and female, and some key persons for obtaining in-depth information related to the program achievements and problems.

Key Informant Interview conducted to understand how far the project achieves its objectives, the core staffs of PARITTRAN and few leaders from group were selected for these purpose.

## **Methods used for activity review and assessing major successes and challenges**

Mostly some PRA tools and techniques used here to detect major successes and challenges. Crosschecking measures also taken for different information.

Evaluation team directly observed the Drama show, group meeting in the project area. Crosscheck and discussion with them help comprehend over all achievement.

Quarter report, monthly activity plan and budget document have checked for the review of management efficiency and understand project implementation performance.

Before after analysis tools have used to judge overall impact.

## **Sampling**

Due to budget and time constraints purposive sampling used in this final evaluation but every component was considered in this process. As most of the data are qualitative in nature that's why probabilistic sampling could not be applied. Evaluation tried to cover every event.

## **Limitations of methodology and evaluation process**

This is very rapid appraisal and HR and protection assessment require long-term involvement. Another crucial limitation that it could not cover the issue- was the results worth the project's cost?

## **Scope of work**

The purpose of this evaluation was to see whether the project was on track to achieve its visionary objectives and addressing targeted group of people according to its agreed project document. Importantly, evaluation tried to explore project related inconsistencies and identify the appropriate strategies to keep/bring back the project on track. The specific objectives of the evaluation were:

- i. Review results achieved against original plan,
- ii. Constraints faced by the project to achieve targeted plan,
- iii. Assess the process, strategy or methodology of implementation,
- iv. Analyze the efficiency and adequacy of project implementation, including timelines of the project activities and its progress, overall performance of the project management,
- v. Assess and measures of changes of lives of direct beneficiaries due to nurture under the project
- vi. Effects of the project at beneficiary level, community level or macro level (depending on nature of project),
- vii. Evaluate overall impact (direct, indirect, positive and negative) of the projects on poverty, gender, environment and policy level
- viii. Assess and measures project sustainability concern for taking decision
- ix. Sketch practical recommendation to strengthen project
- x. Assess quality of MJF capacity building support to PNGO and recommend how it can be strengthened
- xi. Using participatory methods and involving all stakeholders (beneficiaries and other stakeholders) assess the
- xii. Quality of MJF capacity building support to PNGO and recommend how it can be strengthened
- xiii. Strength and weakness of the project (derived in a participatory manner from all stakeholder)
- xiv. Capacity of PNGO to deliver on project objectives.